

The Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan



**National Center for Human Resources Development
(NCHRD)**

**Community Colleges
Assessment Study
Summary Report on the
College-Based Interviews**

**Presented
by**

the Joint Canadian-Jordanian Study Team

**Publications Series No.
March 2005**

121

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

**SUSTAINING AND EXTENDING TECHNICAL
VOCATIONAL
EDUCATION AND TRAINING (SETVET)**

**Community Colleges Assessment Study
Summary Report on the College-Based Interviews**

Presented by the Joint Canadian-Jordanian Study Team

Revised as of March 3, 2005



TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page Number
1. Introduction	1
2. The Performance Assessment Criteria and Study Questions	1
3. The Community Colleges Interview Process, Questionnaire, and Sample.....	4
3.1 The Questionnaire	4
3.2 The Interview Process	4
3.3 The Sample of Colleges	4
4. Foundation Information: Community Colleges Enrolment and Graduation Data	7
5. Summary of Interview Responses	14
5.1 Enrolment and Graduation Trends.....	14
5.1.1 Trends in the Public (BAU, UNRWA, Ministry of Health) Colleges	14
5.1.2 Trends in the Private Colleges.....	16
5.2 Program Planning.....	17
5.2.1 Program Planning for the Public Colleges.....	17
5.2.2 Program Planning for the Private Colleges	19
5.2.3 Balancing Academic and Labour Market Preparation Goals	19
5.2.4 Relationships with Students, Employers, Stakeholders, and the Colleges	20
5.2.4.1 Relationships with Employers.....	20
5.2.4.2 Relationships with Students	21
5.2.4.3 Relationships between Colleges	22
5.2.4.4 Relationships with the TVET Council.....	22
5.3 Program Delivery.....	22
5.4 Accountability for Results	23
5.4.1 Comprehensive Examinations Outcomes	23
5.4.2 Student Satisfaction and Employment Outcomes	24
5.4.3 Employer Satisfaction with the Colleges	24
5.4.4 Existence of an Outcomes-Driven Culture	25
5.5 Challenges	25
5.5.1 Employer Support for the Colleges	25
5.5.2 Government Support for the Colleges.....	26
5.5.3 Adequacy of College Funding.....	26
5.5.4 Finding/Attracting Qualified Teachers	26

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

6.	Preliminary Observations	27
6.1	Challenges as Seen by the Colleges	27
6.2	First Impressions Derived from the College-Based Interviews	29
6.2.1	Imbalance in the Aims of the Community Colleges	29
6.2.2	Unwanted Shifts in Post Secondary Education Enrolment Patterns	29
6.2.3	Competition for Students	30
6.2.4	BAU Administration	30
6.2.5	Integration of Vocational Training/Education with Other Post Secondary Education Initiatives	30
6.2.6	The Labour Market Orientation of the Colleges.....	31
6.2.7	An Absence of Labour Market Information.....	31
6.2.8	Career and Employment Counselling are not Provided to Students.....	31
6.2.9	Addressing Gender Issues.....	31
7.	Next Steps	32

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1:	The College-Based Interview Study Questions.....	2
Table 3.1:	The Sample of Colleges Included in the Interviews	5
Table 4.1:	Examination Throughput Year 2000	8
Table 4.2:	Examination Throughput Year Winter 2002.....	9
Table 4.3:	Examination Throughput Year Summer 2002.....	10
Table 4.4:	Examination Throughput Year Winter 2004.....	11
Table 4.5:	Examination Throughput Year Summer 2004.....	13
Table 4.6:	Examination Throughput – All Colleges Years 2000 to 2004.....	14

1. INTRODUCTION

The community college system in Jordan has been reformed in recent years. Al Balqa' Applied University (BAU), was established in 1997 in an effort to make the community college system more responsive to labour market needs. BAU is directly responsible for all 15 public community colleges, and also accredits all private colleges. BAU operationally monitors and reports on the organization and the effectiveness of the Jordanian college system. This study can be seen as directly supporting the BAU monitoring and reporting role, as the chief outcome of the study is aimed at establishing the effectiveness of the colleges in terms of their performance as measured by the extent to which the colleges are providing programs that meet labour market needs.

The BAU mandate includes two major outcome objectives:

- To provide terminal education leading into specific occupations in practical fields, thus preparing students directly for the labour market; and,
- To provide a minority of students with terminal education to the bachelors degree level in various specializations according to the Jordanian post-secondary education "Bridging Policy".

The focus of the Community Colleges Performance Assessment Study is limited to the first objective: the preparation of students for the labour market through the provision of a two-year associate degree (diploma) education in various specializations. Assessment of the success of the colleges in preparing students for further studies at the university degree level is not a part of the study.

The performance of the community colleges is being assessed against five criteria: impact, effectiveness, efficiency, relevance and sustainability. Secondary sources of information that underpin the study include BAU administrative data, previous Al Manar education and training studies, and Department of Statistics labour market data. Primary data collection involves interviews with community college Deans and staff members, interviews with public and private sector employers, and a survey of college graduates.

The community college interviews were completed during the first mission to Jordan of the Canadian Team, which took place from November 22, 2004 to December 5, 2004. The purpose of this report is to provide the SETVET Steering Committee for the Community Colleges Assessment Study with a fairly comprehensive, yet brief summary, of the college interviews.

2. THE PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT CRITERIA AND STUDY QUESTIONS

In developing the methodology for this assessment study, a large number of study questions were posed under the five performance assessment criteria. The community college interviews were undertaken to help the joint Canadian-Jordanian Study Team address a subset of the study questions. Of course, information from the secondary sources and the other two primary sources (employers and graduates) is also needed to provide complete answers to this subset of questions. In other words, the college-based interviews alone will not provide all of the information required to answer this subset of questions.

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

Table 2.1 contains the specific study questions that are the focus of the college-based interviews.

TABLE 2.1
The College-Based Interviews Study Questions

Performance Assessment Criteria	Study Questions Relevant to the College Interviews
<p>Impact:</p> <p>The degree to which the colleges seem to be producing the number of graduates required to meet current and future labour market demand.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the colleges' graduation rates by program area? • Is it possible to match the college program areas to the different occupations and economic activity areas? • What are the trends in college enrolments by program area?
<p>Effectiveness:</p> <p>The degree to which the colleges are responding to their role (in terms of mission, program/ curriculum development, resource allocation, student recruitment, enrolment and graduation throughput) in the preparation of students for the labour market.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Do the colleges see their mission in large part as one of preparing students for labour market entry and success? • Are the colleges able to show how their programs and curricula respond to the needs of business, industry and government for people with specific knowledge, skills and attitudes? • Do the colleges base their enrolment and graduation numbers on identified labour market requirements? • Are students recruited for the colleges on the basis of labour market destinations?
<p>The extent to which the colleges understand and are responsive to the changing human resource needs of employers.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Are the colleges able to identify both globally and specifically the key human resource needs of employers? ▪ Do the colleges have a systematic way of obtaining and acting on labour market intelligence from employers?
<p>Efficiency:</p> <p>The extent to which the colleges are making use of key mechanisms (such as national and regional labour market information, and employer advisory committees or councils) to identify demand.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Do the colleges systematically obtain current labour market information for use in program and curriculum planning? For providing information to prospective students to assist them in making program/specialization choices? • Do the colleges know who the major employers in their regions are? Do they have any kind of relationship with these employers? • Do the colleges seek and obtain the views of local employers about the objectives, content, and expected outcomes of their programs?

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

Performance Assessment Criteria	Study Questions Relevant to the College Interviews
<p>The degree of coordination with all educational and labour market stakeholders in determining the size and scope of the college system</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have the colleges established relationships with other educational and training providers in their regions? Do they attempt to coordinate their program/specialization offerings with other providers? What is the extent of the competition for students among the different education/training providers? • Are the colleges familiar with the TVET Council strategies and policies for education and training in Jordan? In their region? Do those strategies and policies find their way into the colleges' planning of program/specialization offerings and enrolments?
<p>Relevance:</p> <p>The extent to which the college programs reflect the strategies, policies and priorities established by the National TVET Council.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Do the colleges have a process for reviewing the strategic objectives and priorities of the TVET Council and ensuring those objectives and priorities are reflected in the colleges' administrative, management, program and curriculum plans? • Do the colleges place a high value on the employment rates of their graduates? On the extent of employment in occupations or economic activity areas they believe are related to the graduates' college programs? • Have the colleges put accountability measures in place? • Do the public colleges seek ways of diversifying their financing?
<p>Sustainability:</p> <p>The degree to which the current college system can and should be sustained or expanded relative to the current and forecasted educational and labour market conditions, in terms of the numbers of public and private institutions, the numbers and types of program specializations offered, the numbers of enrolments and graduations, and the global costs involved</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ What are the trends in terms of college enrolments, graduations, and successes on the comprehensive examinations? Do these trends differ by type of college and program area? ▪ Are the colleges experiencing difficulty in maintaining a high quality of education due to shortages of qualified teachers, other types of staff, or because of financial limitations? ▪ Have the colleges attempted to rationalize their programs and the use of resources to meet changing economic, technological, and demographic circumstances?

3. THE COMMUNITY COLLEGES INTERVIEW PROCESS, QUESTIONNAIRE, AND SAMPLE

3.1 The Questionnaire

The Community College Interview Form, presented at appendix 1, was developed from the study questions shown in Table 2.1. It was designed for the Canadian-Jordanian Study Team to use in interviewing community college Deans and staff members.

The interview form was sent in advance, along with an NCHRD-approved letter of introduction, to the Dean of each college scheduled for an interview. The aim was to have the Dean and his/her staff obtain certain information before the interview to enable them to respond fully to the questions. In most cases, the form was received in advance by the college, and an attempt was made by the college Deans and staff members to have some of the answers prepared for the actual interview.

3.2 The Interview Process

The introductory letter sent to the colleges, and the follow up telephone calls made to the colleges, asked the Dean to make himself/herself available for the interview. In most cases, the Deans participated in the interviews, along with one or more of the Vice-Dean and Department Heads.

The interviews were led by the two Canadian Team members with invaluable assistance from the Jordanian Team Coordinator and/or a Jordanian Team Member. Interviews took anywhere from one to two hours, depending on the interest of the college and the desire of the college to have the visitors tour the institution.

3.3 The Sample of Colleges

The Abrahart report (Abrahart, 2004) lists a total of 45 community colleges in Jordan. They are grouped as: BAU (public colleges), Other Government colleges, U.N.R.W.A. colleges, and Private colleges. The sample frame proposed for the College-Based Interviews was based mainly on the college enrolments for 2003/04. The sample had to include enough of the colleges to account for up to 90% of student enrolments as well as a good representation of colleges offering programs and specializations in a variety of areas. Interviews were arranged with 28 colleges to achieve that level of sampling.

In the end, interviews were held with 24 community colleges. The names of the colleges, their status as public, government-run, UNRWA-operated, or private institutions, the programs offered by those colleges, and their gender mix, are presented in Table 3.1.

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

TABLE 3.1
The Sample of Colleges Included in the College-Based Interviews

College Status	College Name	Gender Mix	Programs Offered
Public (BAU)	Princess Rahma	Mixed	Education Social Work
	Al Salt	Mixed	Applied Arts Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries Para-Agricultural Sciences
	Al Zarqa	Female	Applied Arts Administrative and Financial Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries
	Faculty of Engineering Technology (FET)	Mixed	Chemical Engineering Civil Engineering Computer Engineering & Information Technology Electrical Engineering Mechatronics Engineering Mechanical Engineering
	Al Karak	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries Social Work Islamic Studies
	Al Tafleeh	Mixed	Education Administrative and Financial Management of Information and Libraries Engineering
	Irbid	Female	Applied Arts Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical
	Princess Alia	Female	Education Administrative and Financial Applied Arts
	Al Huson University College	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Management of Information and Libraries Engineering
	Ajlun	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Applied Arts Para-Agricultural Sciences

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

College Status	College Name	Gender Mix	Programs Offered
	Ma'an	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Languages
Private	Arabic	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Applied Arts Engineering Islamic Studies Hotel and Tourism
	Islamic	Female	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries
	Cordoba	Female	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries
	Al Khawarismi	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries Applied Arts Engineering Social Work Hotel and Tourism Languages Islamic Studies
	Al Andalus	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Engineering Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries Applied Arts Social Work Hotel and Tourism Languages Islamic Studies
	Hittein	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries
	Al Quds	Mixed	Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries
	Gharnatah	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries Applied Arts Hotel and Tourism Languages

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

College Status	College Name	Gender Mix	Programs Offered
	Ibn Khaldun	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries Hotel and Tourism Languages Islamic Studies
	Zarqa National	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Education Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries Applied Arts Hotel and Tourism Engineering
	Intermediate	Mixed	Administrative and Financial Engineering Para-Medical Management of Information and Libraries Applied Arts Hotel and Tourism Languages
UNRWA	Amman Training College	Mixed	Para-Medical Commercial (Secretarial, Business Admin) Basic Science (IT)
Ministry of Health	Nusayba Al Mazinia for Nursing	Mixed	Nursing Para-Medical

4 FOUNDATION INFORMATION: COMMUNITY COLLEGES ENROLMENT AND GRADUATION DATA

Tables 4.1 to 4.5 provide the examination data for the colleges for the years 2000, 2002 and 2004. The data for all years (2000 to 2004 inclusive) and all examination sessions (winters and summers) were analyzed. The overall aim was to identify any trends in the college graduation and examination pass rates.

As can be seen by examining tables 4.1 to 4.5, the numbers of graduates has remained much the same over the five years. There has been a small increase in the numbers of graduates coming from the public colleges with an almost proportionate decrease in the numbers graduating from the private colleges.

A summary of the examination data taken across all colleges for the five years of 2000 to 2004 is presented in Table 4.6. The examination success rate remained much the same for the years 2000 to 2003 inclusive. However, the pass rate jumped significantly in 2004. This might be the result of what many of the college Deans and staff members said in the interviews about "teaching to the exams" in order to increase their students' success rates.

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

TABLE 4.1
Examination Throughput Year 2000

College Name	Wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage
Amman Training College	204	194	10	95.1
Al Shareef Naser Ben Jameel For Communications	22	10	12	45.5
Para Medical Yajouz	121	99	22	81.8
Para Medical Irbid	94	80	14	85.1
Ajlun University College	733	344	389	46.9
Wadi Al Sair Training College	136	88	48	64.7
Prince Hasan Ben AbdAllah Technical Military	185	89	96	48.1
Gharnatah College/ Al Jaleel	481	460	321	54.1
Faculty of Engineering Technology (FET)	476	310	166	65.1
Princess Alia University College	546	460	86	84.2
Traditional Islamic Studies	16	10	6	62.5
Zarqa University College	446	291	155	65.2
Prince Faisal Technical College	147	89	58	60.5
Royal Jordanian Geographic Center	41	23	18	56.1
Ma'an College	280	244	36	87.1
Prince Hasan For Islamic Sciences	37	35	2	94.6
Al Salt College	587	391	196	66.6
Al Ma'raq College	86	66	20	76.7
Ibn Khaldoun College	173	90	83	52
Al Razi College	64	46	18	71.9
Ammon College	41	30	11	73.2
Al Shobak College	232	62	170	26.7
Amman University College	449	363	68	80.8
Al Tafileh College	171	94	77	55
Al Arabia	523	350	173	66.9
Princess Servat College	471	379	92	80.5
Islamic Community College	512	381	131	74.4
Queen Nour Technical College	41	15	62	36.6
Al Quds College	245	113	132	46.1
Al Huson University College	568	289	179	68.5
Irbid University College	1150	660	490	57.4
Institute of Banking Studies	40	36	4	90
The Royal Medical Services	181	95	86	52.5
Intermediate University College	1394	845	549	60.6
Al Kwarizmi College	205	118	87	57.6
Arab Community College	669	336	333	50.2
Al Qadisia College	135	92	43	68.6
Hetten College	311	187	124	60.1

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

College Name	Wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage
Al Andalus College	303	187	116	61.7
Qordoba College	189	112	76	59.8
Al Karak College	803	379	424	47.2
Queen Alia College	517	278	239	53.8
Zarka National College	391	168	223	43
Institute of Banking Studies	13	9	4	69.2

TABLE 4.2
Examination Throughput Year Winter 2002

College Name	wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage
Amman Training College	2	1	1	50
Institute of Banking studies	14	6	8	42.9
Islamic Community	91	34	57	37.4
Shobak College	43	31	12	72.1
Princes Rahma College	21	16	5	76.2
Wadu Al sair Training College	11	5	6	45.5
AL Qadisia College	37	17	20	45.9
Al Razi College	27	17	10	63
Ammon College	18	16	2	88.9
Para - Medical Irbid	6	5	1	83.3
Irbid College	324	172	152	53.1
Ma'an College	65	38	27	58.5
Para-Medical Yajouz	8	5	3	62.5
Princes Alia University College	87	50	37	57.5
Al Tafileh College	39	22	17	56.4
Al Andalus College	128	52	76	40.6
Al Salt College	85	47	38	55.3
Faculty of Engineering Technology (FET)	105	62	43	59
Ibn Khaldun College	16	8	8	50
Al Quds College	96	42	54	43.8
Princess Sarvat College	116	66	50	56.9
Al Mafraq	16	8	8	50
Royal Jordanian Geographic Center	31	20	11	64.5
Al Karak College	155	77	78	49.7
Gharnatah College	169	86	83	50.9
Al Arabia	225	128	97	56.9
Al Kawarismi College	87	39	48	44.8
Hetten College	121	49	72	40.5

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

College Name	Wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage
Intermediate University	337	153	184	45.4
Ajlun College	198	78	120	39.4
Queen Nour Technical College	23	14	9	60.9
Al Huson College	80	41	39	51.3
Islamic Sciences	11	6	5	54.5
Amman University College	100	52	48	52
Zarqa National College	168	69	99	41.1
The Royal Medical Service	61	23	38	37.7
Qordoba College	53	23	30	43.4
Arab Community College	217	74	143	34.1
Zarqa University College	99	54	45	54.5
Queen Aliaa' College	189	85	104	45
Prince Fesal Technical	26	9	17	34.6
Prince Al Huseen Ben Abdulla Military Technical	41	17	24	41.5
Shreef Naser Ben Jameel For Communications	10	6	4	60

TABLE 4.3
Examination Throughput Year Summer 2002

College Name	Wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage
Amman Training College	163	159	4	97.5
Institute of Banking studies	50	36	14	72
Rufaida for Nursing College	82	75	7	91.5
Shobak College	80	33	47	41.3
Princes Rahma College	104	76	28	73.1
Wadu Al sair Training College	109	83	26	76.1
AL Qadisnia College	80	62	18	77.5
Al Razi College	100	32	68	32
Ammon College	36	20	16	55.6
Para - Medical Irbid	84	70	41	83.3
Irbid University College	683	419	264	61.3
Ma'an College	222	213	9	95.9
Para-Medical Yajouz	58	45	13	77.6
Princes Alia University College	291	214	77	73.5
Al Tafleeh College	61	44	17	72.1
Islamic Science College	21	17	4	81
Al Andalus College	239	133	106	55.6
Al Salt College	409	283	126	69.2
Faculty of Engineering Technology (FET)	331	246	85	74.3

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

College Name	Wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage
Ibn Khaldun College	195	73	122	37.4
Al Quds College	314	151	163	48.1
Princess Sarvat College	364	285	79	78.3
Prince Hasan for Islamic Science	49	43	6	87.8
Al Karak College	520	266	254	51.2
Gharnatah College	636	276	360	43.4
Al Arabia	455	307	148	67.5
Al Kawarismi College	226	104	122	46
Hetten College	337	166	171	49.3
Intermediate University College	689	366	323	53.1
Ajlun College	442	193	249	43.7
Queen Nour Technical College	32	16	16	50
Al Huson College	407	297	110	73
Islamic Community College	383	262	121	68.4
Amman University College	344	277	67	80.5
Zarqa National College	271	119	152	43.9
The Royal Medical Service	233	142	91	60.9
Qordoba College	179	97	82	54.2
Arab Community College	473	197	276	41.6
Zarqa University College	291	197	94	67.7
Nusayba AlMazinia for Nursing College	69	63	6	91.3
Prince Fesal Technical	169	128	41	75.7
Prince AlHuseen Ben Abdulla Military Technical	94	60	34	63.8
Shreef Naser Ben Jameel For Communications	43	19	24	44.2
Royal Jordanian Geographic Center	46	21	25	45.7

TABLE 4.4
Examination Throughput Year Winter 2004

College Name	Wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage
Amman Training College	8	8	0	100
Institute of Banking studies	3	3	0	100
Islamic Community	112	62	50	55.4
Shobak College	48	39	9	81.3
Princes Rahma College	14	11	3	78.6
Wadi Al sair Training College	16	13	3	81.3
AL Qadisia College	57	22	35	38.6
Al Razi College	103	35	68	34
Ammon College	20	15	5	75

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

College Name	Wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage
Para - Medical Irbid	5	5	0	100
Irbid University College	250	167	83	66.8
Ma'an College	95	75	20	78.9
Para-Medical Yajouz	7	4	3	57.1
Princes Alia University College	96	66	30	68.8
Al Tafileh College	26	22	4	84.6
Islamic Science College	0	0	0	0
Al Andalus College	122	55	67	45.1
Al Salt College	112	91	21	81.3
Faculty of Engineering Technology (FET)	86	63	23	73.3
Ibn Khaldun College	115	47	68	40.9
Al Quds College	163	93	70	57.1
Princess Sarvat College	111	67	44	60.4
Al Mafraq	70	21	49	30
Prince Hasan for Islamics Science	1	0	1	0
Al Karak College	202	140	62	69.3
Gharnatah College	274	147	127	53.6
Al Arabia	262	186	76	71
Al Kawarismi College	97	49	48	50.5
Hetten College	143	70	73	49
Intermediate University College	241	131	110	54.4
Ajlun College	74	64	10	86.5
Queen Nour Technical College	9	7	2	77.8
Al Huson College	97	74	23	76.3
Amman University College	87	61	26	70.1
Zarqa National College	102	54	48	52.9
The Royal Medical Service	35	22	13	62.9
Qordoba College	45	27	18	60
Arab Community College	256	113	143	44.1
Zarqa University College	79	57	22	72.2
Queen Aliaa' College	179	90	89	50.3
Prince Fesal Technical	21	13	8	61.9
Prince AlHuseen Ben Abdulla Military Technical	25	13	12	52
Shreef Naser Ben Jameel For Communications	18	14	4	77.8
Royal Jordanian Geographic Center	9	6	3	66.7
Nusayba Al Mazinia for Nursing College	5	5	0	100
Aqaba University College	31	26	5	83.9
Toledo	4	3	1	75
Rufaida for Nursing College	8	6	2	75
Institute of Banking studies	4	2	2	50

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

TABLE 4.5
Examination Throughput Year Summer 2004

College Name	Wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage
Amman Training College	185	185	0	100
Islamic Studies	1	1	0	100
Toledo	10	10	0	100
Aaqaba University College	111	109	2	98.2
Al Shareef Naser Ben Jameel For Communications	30	29	1	96.7
Rufaida for Nursing College	90	85	5	94.4
Princess Rahma University College	78	73	5	93.6
Para Medical Yajouz	102	95	7	93.1
Para Medical Irbid	110	101	9	91.8
Ajlun University College	350	319	31	91.1
Wadi Al Sair Training College	118	104	14	88.1
Prince Hasan Ben AbdAllah Technical Military	91	80	11	87.9
Gharnatah College/ Al Jaleel	49	43	6	87.8
Faculty of Engineering Technology (FET)	262	221	41	84.4
Princess Alia University College	234	193	41	82.5
Toledo College	11	9	2	81.8
Zarqa University College	254	206	48	81.1
Nusayba Al Mazinia forNursing College	99	20	19	80.8
Prince Faisal Technical College	196	156	40	79.6
Royal Jordanian Geographic Center	34	27	7	79.4
Ma'an College	257	202	55	78.6
Institute of Banking Studies	31	24	7	77.4
Al Salt College	469	361	108	77
Gharnatah College	420	176	244	41.9
Al Mafrag College	157	56	101	35.7
Ibn Khaldoun College	132	46	86	34.8
Al Razi College	108	22	86	20.4
Ammon College	29	22	7	75.9
Al Shobak College	65	49	16	75.4
Amman University College	375	281	94	74.9
Al Tafileh College	83	61	22	73.5
Al Arabia	634	460	174	72.6
Princess Servat College	359	256	103	71.3
Islamic Community College	369	261	108	70.7
Queen Nour Technical College	15	10	5	66.7
Al Quds College	474	313	161	66
Al Huson University College	343	223	120	65

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

College Name	Wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage
Irbid University College	731	473	258	64.7
Institute of Banking Studies	11	7	4	63.6
The Royal Medical Services	156	96	60	61.5
Intermediate University College	555	325	230	58.6
Al Kawarizmi College	257	146	111	56.8
Arab Community College	375	210	165	56
Al Qadisia College	140	76	64	54.3
Hetten College	287	155	132	54
Al Andalus College	298	156	142	52.3
Qordoba College	93	47	46	50.5
Al Karak College	444	223	221	50.2
Queen Alia College	261	129	132	49.4
Zarka National College	173	83	90	48

TABLE 4.6
Examination Throughput – All Colleges Years 2000 to 2004

Year	Wrote	Passed	Failed	Percentage Success
2000	14646	8997	5649	61.4%
2001	15535	9473	6062	61.0%
2002	14247	8202	6039	57.6%
2003	15039	9106	5933	60.1%
2004	14403	9379	5024	65.1%

The college enrolment figures for the years 2001 to 2004 were also examined. Some significant variability in the enrolments at certain colleges was noted. Table 4.7 provides a summary of the enrolment figures (numbers and percentage share by college type) for the 2001-2004 period.

The figures in table 4.7 would seem to suggest that the private colleges accounted for an increasing share of enrolments up to the end of 2003. In 2004, the public colleges seemed to have increased their overall share of enrolments, reversing the earlier trend. However, in absolute terms, the 2004 enrolments show a decline, even in the public colleges where they are offering bachelor degree programs. Enrolments in the two-year programs are in decline, according to the BAU statistics and in the view of the college deans.

TABLE 4.7
Community College Enrolment Numbers and Percentage Share by College Type

College Type	Enrolment Numbers and Percentage Share							
	2001		2002		2003		2004	
	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
Private	7744	50	7298	53	8818	59	7874	55
Public	6759	44	5405	39	5256	35	5407	38
Other Government	706	5	879	6	703	5	806	6
UNRWA	285	1	285	2	274	1	328	1
TOTALS	15494	100	13867	100	15051	100	14415	100

5 SUMMARY OF INTERVIEW RESPONSES

5.1 Enrolment and Graduation Trends

5.1.1 Trends in the Public (BAU; UNRWA; Ministry of Health) Colleges

Overall Trend

- Overall enrolments have declined since 2000. This trend is expected to continue with enrolments in the two-year programs particularly affected.
- Enrolments are increasing somewhat in the colleges that offer university preparatory (academic) and/or degree programs. The reason for this is that the colleges have lower admission requirements than the public or private universities. Enrolments in the bachelor degree programs or in two-year programs that can help students bridge to the degree programs is where the increases in enrolments have occurred.
- By adding degree programs to their offerings, the community colleges are indeed "transforming" themselves from a community college to a "university college".
- Many students enroll in college programs because they do not have high enough grades in secondary school to be admitted to university. After completing a two-year diploma program, some get admitted to university with credits given for some of their college courses. The colleges estimate that about 60% of their students go on to university after graduation from the two-year programs in the belief they are improving their employment prospects.
- Increasing enrolments are evident in some of the program specializations that have been extended to the degree level, such as Management Information Systems (MIS), Information Technology (IT), Environmental Engineering, Telecommunications Engineering, Air Conditioning and Heating, Associate Nursing, and Fashion Design.
- Where college enrolments have increased, the increase has favoured females. The colleges estimate that enrolment rates of females to males is currently running at 80% to 20%. Of course, some colleges only enroll females.

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational Education and Training (SETVET)

- Enrolments in some engineering programs are in real decline. The Scientific and Industrial streams tend to attract mostly males. Engineering enrolments, particularly in the traditional fields, are declining at some colleges. The colleges have found that the students are going to the university because of lower admission standards at the universities, and because of their desire to go to a larger centre for schooling.
- As well, enrolments and graduations in Social Work are diminishing.

College Funding and Tuition Fees

- The public colleges are government subsidized. Tuition fees are not expected to cover the entire costs of educating students at the colleges. Therefore, public community college tuition fees are less expensive per year than the private colleges, public universities, or private universities. This is an important factor in the increasing share (percentage) of enrolments that took place in 2004 at the public colleges.
- Some of the colleges are introducing programs as "parallel programs". These are programs for which the students pay twice the regular (government subsidized) fees. The colleges believe they are improving the flow of money into BAU by enrolling more students in these programs.

Post Graduation Employment

- Some graduates from a number of colleges are reporting to the colleges that they find work at higher than Jordan wages in several other gulf states (notably Saudi Arabia).
- Government employment, according to the latest labour force figures from the Department of Statistics, accounts for roughly half of all employment in Jordan. Several of the Deans and college staff interviewed suggested that many college graduates seem to be expecting employment in the government. The colleges believe that those expectations are not realistic because of recent government employment freezes.
- Traditionally, the majority of graduates from the two-year community college education programs found employment in the elementary schools. However, the Ministry of Education has made it a requirement, since 1996, for all teachers to hold at least a bachelor degree. Thus, increasing numbers of college graduates from the two-year education programs are not being directly employed in the schools. A majority of these graduates find they have to go on to a degree program, either at the same college, or at a university. Some colleges reported up to 99% of their education program students going on to a bachelor degree program or even higher degree levels.
- Among the education program students, the graduates from Special Education are currently finding employment in schools as special education teaching assistants, in hospitals and with some of the non-government organizations (NGOs) where they work with the disabled.
- The Special Education program is offered by nine institutions (four public and five private), so there is competition among those colleges to attract students.
- Over the past several years some of the colleges have expanded their Para-Medical program specializations, and added new specializations. Employment for the associate nursing graduates is nearly 100%, and employment rates for laboratory technicians are also believed to be high. Most associate nurses work in public institutions, but laboratory technicians are found in larger numbers in the private sector (clinics, etc.).
- Business and finance two-year program graduates are reported by the colleges as having the most success in finding private sector jobs.

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational Education and Training (SETVET)

- A few of the colleges observed a trend toward an "inefficient use of community college resources". Some students take two-year programs just to fill time, for self-improvement, or to improve their chances of getting into a degree program.

5.1.2 Trends in the Private Colleges

Overall Trend

- For the vast majority of private colleges, enrolments declined from 2003 to 2004. There is a sense that this decrease in their enrolments will become a trend dramatic enough to threaten their survival.
- The chief reasons for the 2003-2004 decline in enrolments are perceived to be:
 - The lowering of admission requirements for private universities from 65% to 50%;
 - The Ministry of Education requirement that all teachers in primary and secondary schools have at least a bachelor degree. Many of the private colleges had large enrolments in education. These have declined sharply. The private colleges believe they cannot reverse this trend unless they are permitted by the Higher Education Council to offer bachelor degree programs, at least in Education; and,
 - The decrease in government financial support for universities. The universities are now trying to dramatically increase enrolments to make up the difference for the lost government revenues.
- In some fields where the private colleges used to play a larger role, students are instead taking degree programs at public colleges because they feel job opportunities are more abundant for degree graduates.
- A brighter area for the colleges is the Financial and Business Management programs where enrolments seem to be growing. For some colleges these programs account for 38% of all new enrolments.
- A number of the private colleges have been cutting the staff and classroom space for education programs, setting up computer teaching programs instead. However, increased enrolments have not materialized.

College Funding and Tuition Fees

- Enrolments have remained steady for some of the private colleges. In a few of these cases, the colleges said their fees are often discounted to provide for the needs of students from lower income families, who make up a majority of their student base.
- To make allowances for their higher fees, relative to the public colleges, some of the private colleges regularly discount fees from 25% to 100%. They also solicit support from the community to help their students in other ways.
- To maintain their "bottom line", private colleges have tried adding programs and specializations to their college offerings. For a few of the colleges, there has been a 30% increase in the number of specializations and courses they offer. The colleges believe these new specializations are required by the labour market, and will attract students.
- Several of the private colleges are experiencing growth, while a majority of the others are in a state of decline. These "success stories" are attributed, by the colleges themselves, to:

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational Education and Training (SETVET)

- Their provision of good student support;
- Effective and efficient registration and student administration;
- Provision from college funds (given by investors) of grants to students for fees and minor expenses;
- The arrangement of part-time jobs off campus for some students and the provision of part-time work on campus for others;
- Having the "best of staff"; and,
- Providing student orientation at the start of each semester.

Post Graduation Employment

- The colleges and students have recognized that the Civil Service Bureau is employing many fewer college graduates than previously.
- Some colleges have introduced one year courses for which the college awards students certificates. These were put in place to meet the specific needs of employers, and to help youth enter the labour market with enough skills to qualify for available jobs. These include courses in areas like medical secretarial studies and jewelry.
- The private colleges are proud of their high rates of employment for their graduates. However, few could provide much information on how they keep track of graduate employment. Some colleges boasted of very high graduate employment rates, but again had no way of verifying the claims. Most of those not employed after receiving the two year associate degree (diploma) go on to university.
- The private colleges, like their public counterparts, have seen a steady increase in enrolments in the Associate Nursing specialization. Employment prospects are excellent for these graduates, who find work immediately upon graduation in either a Jordanian hospital or clinic, or in an institution in one of the Gulf states.

5.2 Program Planning

5.2.1 Program Planning for the Public Colleges

Factors the Student Must Consider

- According to the Deans and college staff interviewed, the first factor the student considers in planning college attendance is the tuition costs. Two year programs cost less than the four year bachelor program. In some cases such as in Special Education, potential wages are not perceived as being much higher with the degree than with the diploma.
- Another factor students must consider is their secondary school grades. Entry to the four year program requires a higher post-secondary grade average than for the two-year programs. Students often take the two year associate program, then apply for admission to the four year degree program upon completing the associate program. They generally are able to get credits for the two-year program of one to one and a half years toward the bachelor degree.

Factors the College Must Consider

- Program planning is considered by the colleges to be a complex exercise. It is tied in many ways to the BAU funding base and budget process in that BAU is not likely to

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational Education and Training (SETVET)

approve the offering of programs and specializations by a college that will prove too costly for the BAU budget. This is an overriding constraint in planning the following year's program.

- The public colleges are primarily "program-driven", and to a lesser extent "student needs-driven". They are much less "labour market-driven" in their planning.
- The primary factors considered by the public colleges in planning their programs are:
 - The number of students currently enrolled who will continue their program of studies;
 - The existing teaching capacity for each program and specialization already offered (although the college can add some part-time teachers to stretch certain programs a little);
 - Laboratory capacities and classroom space;
 - The amount of equipment available;
 - The number of field training placements the college can realistically expect to arrange in each specialization;
 - Student demand for certain specializations;
 - Employer demand (where it can be determined) for workers in the different specializations (mostly for the government sector, e.g. associate nurses); and,
 - Directions/decisions from BAU on what specializations to offer, and how many students to enroll in each.
- The colleges contend that the new programs and specializations they asked BAU to allow them to offer were developed in response to the expressed needs of employers (e.g. the Ministry of Health for Associate Nursing; construction companies for road and bridge construction engineering).
- The problem in trying to relate enrolments in existing specializations or the development of new specializations to labour market opportunities is that the colleges lack good labour market information.
- In some cases, the colleges have continued to run certain specializations because of student demand (e.g. childhood education) even though the college knows that few graduates from that area will be able to find employment (e.g. in the elementary schools).
- The colleges state flatly that it is not easy to estimate either labour market demand for public or private sector employment, or to exactly predict student enrolment numbers.

5.2.2 Program Planning in the Private Colleges

- Like the public colleges, the private colleges are primarily "program-driven" or "student needs-driven" in their program planning. Labour market employment opportunities or even the past success of graduates in finding employment are considered in program planning to a much lesser extent than one might expect.
- A primary consideration for the private colleges is the extent to which the college feels it can successfully market its programs to potential students. For most of the private colleges, a key goal has to be attracting students in sufficient numbers for the programs and specializations already developed (where the initial investment has been made).
- Another factor considered by the private colleges that few public colleges even think about is the offering of programs and specializations not run by any nearby institutions. To survive economically, the private colleges need to find their program "niche". One result of this effort has been the appearance of one year specializations in the private

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

colleges. The college awards a certificate to the student upon completion. The one-year programs are normally closely tied to actual employer job requirements.

- The private colleges also have to consider the possibility of competing for students with universities that now also offer one year certificate courses and other short courses, as well as accepting students with secondary school averages as low as 55%.
- Private colleges also try to find various means for using the existing college plant to the maximum. Some of the private colleges have established elementary schools in adjoining premises in order to make profitable use of their space.
- In most other ways, private college program planning follows most of the same steps as public college planning. BAU also must approve all new program/specializations offered by the private colleges, just as it does for the public ones. BAU even sets the maximum enrolments in certain specializations for the private colleges (e.g. not more than 30 students in scientific specializations and not more than 45 in literary specializations).
- The private colleges certainly are interested in the labour market requirements of the local area. However, like the public colleges, they have difficulty in assembling the necessary labour market information. They do the best they can through the use of their personal sources and regular contacts with employers.

5.2.3 Balancing Academic and Labour Market Preparation Goals

- Some earlier studies of the community colleges have suggested that the colleges spend too much time educating students in academic areas and too little in providing them with the practical skills needed in the labour market.
- The colleges were asked about their relative priorities for the university preparation (academics) of students and the labour market preparation of students. On a scale of very low (1) to very high (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings	
	University Preparatory	Labour Market Preparatory
Public Colleges	3.8	3.8
Private Colleges	2.4	4.4

- The public colleges feel they are providing an even balance in terms of priorities. Of course the public colleges also offer the four-year bachelor degree program. The private colleges are more focused on labour market preparation, and are not permitted to offer a bachelor degree program.

5.2.4 Relationships with Students, Employers, Stakeholders, and Other Colleges

5.2.4.1 Relationships with Employers

- The colleges were asked to indicate the extent of their FORMAL and INFORMAL linkages with employers. On a scale ranging from "none" (1) to "more than enough" (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings	
	Formal Linkages	Informal Linkages
Public Colleges	3.2	3.9
Private Colleges	2.3	3.4

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

- The informal linkages for both public and private colleges consist of social networking and inviting employer "decision-makers" to give lectures at the colleges, and thereby become familiar with the college programs and students.
- A few colleges have established formal agreements with employers not only for the field training of students, but also for the shared use of classroom/lab/ workshop space at the colleges. In these cases, industry provides the equipment and the college supplies the instructors and space.
- Another consistent point of contact with employers is those made through the colleges' arrangements for the field training of students.
- Several of the private colleges have established "employment or placement departments". The Head of this department meets regularly with employers, maintains a database of employer contacts and needs, and sets up seminars for students to meet with the employers. Another approach tried at one private college is the establishment of an Alumni Association with the primary mandate of connecting employed graduates with current students in order to broaden the college's contacts with employers.
- The two UNRWA colleges in Jordan have access to a department in UNRWA that serves as an employment placement office. That office actively solicits job vacancies from public and private employers, and then matches the colleges' graduates to the vacancies, with the UNRWA making the referrals of graduates to the employers.
- The colleges were asked to indicate the extent to which they try to adapt their programs to the needs of employers. On a scale ranging from "never" (1) to "all of the time" (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	2.9
Private Colleges	2.8

- A number of the colleges said that they had made enquiries of industry about their job skill requirements. The colleges felt that the employers did not provide good information. In many cases, employers declined to respond, feeling it may obligate them to hire the college's graduates.
- Employers sometimes suggested program needs, and the colleges set up working groups to consider the development of new programs (e.g. Pharmacy). Enrolment is uncertain in such cases. In one case, a Pharmacy program was approved by BAU, the program was developed and the lab set up. But in the end, not enough students (fewer than five) enrolled. The specialization was dropped for 2004-05.
- A significant effort to have employer input to college curricula occurred under a joint Pilot Project with Canada. A Development and Planning group was set up with representation from a few colleges and some employers. Participants were invited to symposia where curricula content was validated/changed.
- By and large, the colleges do not invest a lot of time in asking employers about their programs. The main reason is that BAU must approve any change to the curricula (for private as well as public colleges), and that takes time and effort. BAU also controls the resource levels of the public colleges. By the time changes are made, the colleges cannot be sure that student enrolment will be sufficient to maintain or add a new program.
- One approach to resolving this problem, being used in one college, is to deliver the specified curricula from BAU, then add hours of instruction as required to meet practical job requirements. For example, one college has most of their students take ICDL training and write the ICDL exams to demonstrate proficiency in the use of computers.

5.2.4.2 Relationships with Students

- The colleges were asked to indicate the extent to which they try to adapt their programs to the needs and interests of students. On a scale ranging from "never" (1) to "all of the time" (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	2.6
Private Colleges	2.6

- The colleges said they try to meet the desires of students for enrolment in one program or the other. In the end, the colleges cannot expand capacity quickly to meet student preferences, but must offer students admission to programs for which they have capacity.
- Most of the colleges get feedback from students after the field training on the content of their programs, but this has not resulted in changes to the programs.
- Young people coming through the secondary schools receive little if any career guidance from the schools. Thus, the colleges cannot obtain information on student interests and needs from the secondary schools. From time to time, some of the colleges give presentations about their programs to the secondary school teachers and students, but this is not a two-way exchange of information. Career advice-giving really does not start until the students enroll in the colleges, and in most instances, they get little career direction even in the colleges.

5.2.4.3 Relationships Between Colleges

- The colleges were asked to indicate the extent of their FORMAL and INFORMAL linkages with the other colleges. On a scale ranging from "none" (1) to "more than enough" (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings	
	Formal Linkages	Informal Linkages
Public Colleges	3.4	3.9
Private Colleges	2.3	2.9

- The public colleges are formally organized within the BAU. The deans of these colleges attend the college deans monthly meetings that are chaired by BAU.
- Private colleges do not collaborate a lot with one another or with the public colleges. They see this as working against their ability to compete with the others for students. In fact, the relations of the private colleges are better established with the private universities. Some are able to have their students use universities facilities such libraries, and in a few special cases, laboratories.
- The private colleges feel they have little influence on the BAU even though BAU regulates the private colleges.

5.2.4.4 Relationships with the TVET Council

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

- The colleges were asked to indicate the extent to which they know about and/or interact with the TVET Council. On a scale ranging from “never” (1) to “all of the time” (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	2.1
Private Colleges	1.5

- Most of the public and private colleges do not see the connection of the TVET work with the community college mandate.

5.3 Program Delivery

- The colleges were asked about the extent to which they gather information on the labour market (demand and supply for human resources, sectors of economic growth, etc.) and whether they make such information available to students. On a scale ranging from “never” (1) to “all of the time” (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	2.6
Private Colleges	2.5

- Some, but certainly not the majority, of the public and private colleges gather follow up employment data from their graduates informally. They also question employers who hire their graduates informally. Just a few of the colleges have any systematic way of collecting information from graduates, employers, or other sources. Those colleges are able to provide some types of labour market information to their students.
- One private college conducts a formal survey every year of its graduates (in person and by phone) in order to determine their employment status. This college also gathers employer requests for employment referrals and posts them on a “job board”.
- Just one public college participating in the interviews said they have a Student Affairs Office that gathers labour market information from employers and employment status from their graduates. This data are provided to students at sessions at the beginning of year. The data includes starting wages in different occupations.
- Having attended a “Job Search Techniques Workshop” Training for Trainers course, one college staff member said her public college will begin offering these kinds of workshops to their students on a monthly basis.
- One private college has included in its Hotel Management curriculum a Job Search Techniques course.
- All of the colleges considered the labour market information produced by DOS and Al Manar not to be specific enough to their regions and to be unrealistic.
- The Civil Service Bureau provides lists of jobs in demand on occasion. In many colleges, these lists are made available to the students.
- The colleges were also asked if employers came to the colleges to recruit their graduates. On a scale ranging from “not at all” (1) to “entirely” (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	2.0
Private Colleges	1.8

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

- Just one public said that large numbers of employers conduct job interviews on the campus. The college often has to help prepare the industry people to conduct the interviews, and also coaches its students for the interviews.
- In a few cases, representatives from government departments such as Agriculture, and private employers go to the college to give presentations and to interview students prior to graduation.

5.4 Accountability for Results

- The interviews focused on four areas where colleges should be accountable for results:
 - The pass/fail outcomes of their students on the comprehensive exams (administered by BAU for all two-year associate programs);
 - The satisfaction of graduates with the college programs and the graduates' success in finding relevant employment;
 - Employers' satisfaction with the quality and job-readiness of college graduates; and,
 - The relationship of the costs of the colleges' programs to the results they achieve.

5.4.1 Comprehensive Examination Outcomes

- The colleges were asked about the kind of focus they have on their students' comprehensive examination results, and the extent to which they track their results. On a scale ranging from "never" (1) to "all the time" (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	5
Private Colleges	5

- The public and private colleges consider the outcomes of the comprehensive examinations as a measure of their success. Most of the colleges were able to quote average pass rates across all of their programs, and the rates ranged from 70% to 99%.
- A good proportion of the private colleges said they "teach to the exams" and coach students in preparation for the examinations. This tendency was not as strong in the public colleges.

5.4.2 Student Satisfaction and Employment Outcomes

- The colleges were asked if they survey their students at some point after graduation to determine their success in finding relevant employment. On a scale ranging from "never" (1) to "all the time" (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	2.9
Private Colleges	2.6

- A majority of the public and private colleges do not have a systematic way of determining the employment success of their graduates.

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

- Just one public college actually surveyed its graduates, with its Student Affairs Office calling almost all graduates to determine their employment status in relation to their field of training. They found that 90% were employed.
- One private college has a special section that follows up on ALL graduates they can contact to determine if they are employed, and if so, if they are employed in their specialization.
- A few of the public colleges have their Department Heads try to verify the employment status of their graduates. Some telephone graduates and some send out surveys in the mail, but not in any systematic way.
- A number of the public and private colleges said they plan on developing written surveys to follow up on student outcomes.
- A majority of the public colleges said that a government body should systematically track college graduates in terms of their employment success.

5.4.3 Employer Satisfaction with the Colleges

- The colleges were asked if they survey employers to determine if their graduates are meeting employers' requirements. On a scale ranging from "never" (1) to "all the time" (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	2.7
Private Colleges	2.6

- A few colleges said they have started to visit employers to get information on the employment status of their graduates. A few colleges plan on sending employers a questionnaire. However, most surveying is done ad hoc by telephone.

5.4.4 Existence of an Outcomes-Driven Culture

- The colleges were asked if they thought their funding/resource allocations were tied in any way to the results they achieve. On a scale ranging from "not at all" (1) to "entirely" (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	1.9
Private Colleges	4.0

- Clearly, the public colleges do not believe that BAU is interested in either their graduates comprehensive examination success or their success in finding employment. BAU has not established a means of verifying employment outcomes in order to hold the colleges to account. A number of the public colleges said they feel that BAU is not concerned about low post graduation employment rates.
- Most of the public college said their success in getting what they need depends more on the relationship of the Dean to BAU key people than on college results (either in terms of comprehensive examination pass rates or post graduation employment rates).
- The private colleges (except for one that is registered as a not-for-profit organization) must be able to "balance the books" each year. Their focus is largely on profit – having revenue from fees exceed the costs for running the college. They suggested that this is the only result their investors are interested in.

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

- However, all of the private colleges are concerned about their reputation in the community since that is a major factor in drawing students to the colleges. They are “results-driven” to the extent that their students’ comprehensive examination results and their graduates’ employment success affect their reputation, and thus their ability to draw students.

5.5 Challenges

- The colleges were asked about four areas of challenge:
 - Extent of employer support for the colleges and their programs;
 - Extent of government support for the colleges and their programs;
 - The adequacy of their funding to offer quality programs; and,
 - Extent of difficulty in finding/attracting qualified teachers.

5.5.1 Employer Support for the Colleges

- Colleges were asked if they felt employers were generally supportive of their institutions. On a scale ranging from “not at all” (1) to “entirely” (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	3.6
Private Colleges	3.1

- Many of the public colleges felt that employers hold the colleges in high regard because all education providers of all types are held in high regard in Jordan.
- A good number of the public colleges said that a number of graduates eventually go to work in other Gulf states, and that their credentials are obviously considered good.
- A few of the public colleges noted that the largest number of employers are public sector, and they tend to be somewhat indifferent to the role and value of the College.
- One measure of employer support has been the cash donations made by employers to some of the private colleges, as well as the contributions by employers of equipment like computers, and the provision of engineering equipment in exchange for the shared use of college labs.
- Several of the private colleges noted with pride that they receive many requests for training facilities from foreign governments through those governments’ embassies.

5.5.2 Government Support for the Colleges

- Colleges were asked if they felt government departments and agencies were generally supportive of their institutions. On a scale ranging from “not at all” (1) to “entirely” (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	3.7
Private Colleges	3.1

- The formation of BAU was judged by almost all public and private colleges to be “a positive step”. BAU provides a sense “professionalism” and “a level of excellence” to the

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

colleges. However, BAU's administrative practices are considered to be meddlesome and often counterproductive.

- Many colleges insisted that there is not enough cooperation and collaboration among the Ministry of Higher Education, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Planning, and BAU.

5.5.3 Adequacy of College Funding

- Colleges were asked if they felt their funding was adequate to support high quality programs. On a scale ranging from "not at all" (1) to "entirely" (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	2.6
Private Colleges	3.8

- Many of the public colleges, who are funded by BAU, believe the level of funding was adequate up to 2003. However, there have been budget cuts year after year. Last year a number of the colleges said they only received 25% of the promised budget. Now BAU funding is only adequate to cover the maintenance of labs and materials. It is not sufficient to UPGRADE labs and library resources.

5.5.4 Finding/Attracting Qualified Teachers

- Colleges were asked if they have had any difficulty in finding or attracting qualified teachers for their institution and programs. On a scale ranging from "not at all" (1) to "entirely" (5), the average ratings were:

College Type	Average Ratings
Public Colleges	3.0
Private Colleges	2.7

- Public colleges in the vicinity of Amman do not experience any difficulty in finding qualified teachers, except in a few specialized areas (e.g. Accounting Information Systems, Management Information Systems, Associated Nursing). The primary reason for this difficulty is that the salaries of college teachers is lower than that for university professors, and less than the teachers can receive if they move to one of the Gulf states.
- Both public and private colleges in locations at some distance from Amman have some difficulty in replacing teachers because so many want to work in Amman.
- Most of the colleges find they have to use part-time teachers from the universities.

6 PRELIMINARY OBSERVATIONS

6.1 Challenges As Seen by the Colleges

BAU Administration

- Many of the colleges feel that the BAU administrative practices are too centralized. They complain that BAU makes decisions on even the smallest issues, and this lessens

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational Education and Training (SETVET)

the independence of the colleges. This is also seen as very inefficient. The colleges want to work with BAU to find ways for decentralizing the administration.

- The planning and decision-making process for program change is seen as much too cumbersome. It also takes too long. Some colleges said it took more than a year to get approval to offer a new or modified specialization. By the time approval was given, circumstances at the college had changed.
- Colleges all too often get approval to run a program but with too little planning about how qualified teaching staff will be attracted and retained, and if the college will be able to purchase and maintain all of the needed equipment, tools and materials. The colleges would like the BAU program approval process to focus more on the practical aspects of implementing new specializations.
- A few of the colleges believe they generate a substantial amount of revenue from fees for BAU, especially through the "parallel program". These colleges want to have their budget allocations reflect the level of income provided by them to BAU.
- Some of the colleges would like BAU to develop an accountability system that focuses on results. Current data systems are inadequate for this. The colleges feel a national data collection system and database to track college graduates is required.

Hiring of College Teachers

- A majority of the colleges believe that too many teachers have been drawn from the universities. The two-year programs are aimed at preparing students for entry into specific occupations. The teachers too often have little practical experience in those occupations.

The Need for Better Labour Market Information

- DOS and Al Manar produce statistics and labour market reports at least on an annual basis. However, those statistics do not directly connect the college programs and specializations with occupations. It is difficult to ascertain the levels of employment and unemployment by occupation in relation to the college specializations. This is the kind of information that may inform students about the possibilities of employment in fields related to their program of studies. The information would also help the colleges plan their future programs in a more realistic context.
- Up-to-date labour market information has to be compiled at a national level. It also needs to be prepared in a format that students can understand. Current labour market statistics are not useful to students.
- All of the colleges suggested they should offer courses that will provide the knowledge and skills for students to undertake an effective job search after graduation.

Competition for Students Among the Public and Private Colleges

- The private colleges believe they cannot compete on an even footing with the public colleges. The public colleges can charge lower fees because they do not have to recover the total costs for program development and delivery from the fees. The private colleges also believe, whether it is true or not, that the public colleges are given preference in terms of student field training placements and eventual hiring by government employers (hospitals and the Civil Service Bureau).

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational Education and Training (SETVET)

- Every year many of the private colleges have to reduce their operational base to remain competitive. They see a partial solution to this situation. They have repeatedly asked the Ministry of Higher Education to allow them to provide a mix of post-secondary education by offering at least one program to the bachelor (four-year) level. They feel this will help them maintain their enrolment levels overall. So far, that request has not been approved.
- Another problem area that must be addressed is the condition under which BAU gives approval to the offering of new specializations by the private colleges. Once a college develops a new program at its great expense, the program has to be approved by BAU. After BAU approves, it distributes the "developed program" free of charge to other private and public colleges who are the initiating college's competitors. This makes no business sense at all.

Rethinking Post-Secondary Education Policy for Jordan

- Several colleges explained that a strategy is needed in Jordan to deal with the perceived oversupply of university graduates. Often, college graduates do not find work because employers hire university graduates for the same work at roughly the same salary as would be paid a college graduate.
- A number of colleges question the usefulness of the comprehensive examinations. They understand and support the requirement to have a measurable standard for labour market-related education and training. However, they feel the examinations focus more and more on theory and less on the practical and performance aspects of the fields of study. They are worried that the examinations may prove to be the undoing of the whole college system, as a large number of colleges are "teaching to the examination" and not to the knowledge and skills needed in the marketplace.

6.2 First Impressions Derived from the College-Based Interviews

6.2.1 Imbalance in the Aims of the Community Colleges

- In Jordan as in many countries, cultural and societal biases exist toward education. Young people and their parents see university degrees as the desirable educational objectives. In this kind of cultural environment, lowering the admission requirements for university degrees naturally draws more students away from entering college programs. Some of the public college Deans and staff members said that the private universities have lowered their admission requirements to get higher enrolments.
- Having community colleges organized under the umbrella of an "applied university" accentuates the natural cultural/societal bias favouring a university education.
- While the original mandate of the community colleges was to prepare students for the labour market, more students are now attending the colleges not to attain skills for direct job entry but as bridging to university programs.
- Thus, the two-year college diploma is being undermined and undervalued.

6.2.2 Unwanted Shifts in Post Secondary Education Enrolment Patterns

- Lower university admission standards are draining students from the colleges and adding to a perceived over supply of degree graduates.

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational Education and Training (SETVET)

- Employers tend to hire university over two-year college graduates even when the two and four year graduates are equally capable of doing the job (in terms of realistic job entry skill needs). This is particularly the case when they can pay them the same, something likely to occur in a weak Jordanian labour market.

6.2.3 Competition For Students

- Since public colleges can offer bachelor degree programs as well as the two-year diploma but private colleges cannot, private colleges find themselves unable to compete on an equal footing with the public colleges. Private colleges also charge higher fees than the public ones, because the public colleges do not have to recover from student fees the full costs of developing and delivering their programs. In general, public colleges charge fees that approximately cover the costs of NEW specializations. The fees are only 30% - 40% of costs for existing specializations.
- On the other hand, Aqaba University College has noted a difficulty in attracting students into its Hospitality and Tourism program. It said that the government reportedly gave a grant to the privately operated Amoun College of Hospitality which has had the effect of reducing the students' tuition fees there. This is one example of a private college being given a competitive edge over a public one.
- If the present public policy on college and university education is not changed, a number of the private community colleges say they may go out of business. The financially stronger ones would likely continue to operate successfully.
- The public colleges' competition for students (between each other as well as with the private colleges), and the efforts of some colleges to increase their share of the income BAU derives from fees, are most probably detracting from the overall quality of college education.

6.2.4 BAU Administration

- BAU appears to be highly centralized, exercising control in areas that would normally remain the sole purview of each college (e.g. hiring of teachers).
- BAU exercises considerable control over the operations of the private colleges. It retains the right to approve of the programs and specializations a private college can run in a given academic year. BAU even puts quotas on the number of enrolments private colleges can accept for their programs and specializations. This control over the private colleges seriously limits their ability to compete fairly with the public colleges and may be preventing them from adjusting their intakes to better match labour market requirements.

6.2.5 Integration of Vocational Training/Education With Other Post Secondary Education Initiatives

- Not all of the initiatives being undertaken by the NCHRD are well known in the colleges. All but one of the eleven college deans had little knowledge of the TVET Council and the TVET initiative. College deans and their department heads did not know that Jordan has an official "occupational structure". It seems that the colleges are operating largely outside of the TVET and other joint Jordanian – Canadian initiatives.

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

6.2.6 The Labour Market Orientation of the Colleges

- The connection of colleges to employers is tenuous because:
 - The colleges are not necessarily results-driven in terms of graduates finding employment;
 - The colleges and BAU itself have not acquired a "performance culture";
 - Public college deans move all too frequently, and many come from the universities (academia), making it more difficult for colleges to connect with employers; and,
 - Except for one or two, none of the public or private colleges had formal agreements or sufficient regular contact with employers to suggest a strong effort at marketing of the colleges' programs and graduates to employers.

6.2.7 An Absence of Labour Market Information

- There is a total absence of labour market information available in an easily understandable format to college staff, as well as to the students in the colleges. Such information is critical for students to determine where and how to look for work after graduation. It is vital to students for program planning, and for secondary school students individual career decision-making. The Department of Statistics and Al Manar labour market reports are not used in any perceivable way by college staff.

6.2.8 Career and Employment Counselling are not Provided to Students

- Only two of the community colleges involved in the interviews had a program of career counseling or "career advising". Many of the colleges suggested that these programs are not needed as the families of students decide on their career direction.
- The absence of vocational, career, and employment counselling or the simple giving of advice is likely having a negative impact on the success of graduates in finding work that they are interested in, have the aptitude for, and have been well prepared for.
- As well, secondary students are not given any form of vocational/career direction.

6.2.9 Addressing Gender Issues

- Some colleges did not seem aware of the need to address gender issues. Increasing female enrolments, albeit in traditional program areas, were considered as sufficient in meeting public policy regarding gender equality.
- Not one college had a program of "active intervention" aimed at finding ways of encouraging female participation in non-traditional areas of economic activity.
- It was also observed that numbers of female college students are not labour market oriented or labour market destined to start with. Of course, data from the Graduate Tracer Study may help to confirm or deny this. Some females seem to undertake community college programs to enhance their personal standing, to satisfy personal interests, or to prepare for occasional work, part-time work, or self-employment. Although these objectives are positive, the employment impact statistics from the two-year programs will, as a result, likely be skewed negatively. It can be questioned if community colleges are fulfilling their mandate when they knowingly accept females into

Sustaining and Extending Technical Vocational
Education and Training (SETVET)

“labour market preparation programs” when they are not, in fact, labour market destined. This may be an important policy issue.

7. NEXT STEPS

- This report is not the final Community Colleges Assessment Report. It is a report on just part of the study, i.e. the interviews completed with community college staff.
- Just prior to finalization of this report, the following were completed:
 - A Labour Market Review Report was submitted to SETVET; and,
 - Up to 47 employers were interviewed and their responses analyzed in the light of the information provided in this report.
- Over the next three months, the following steps will be undertaken:
 - From 1,200 to 1,500 community college graduates will fill out a Tracer Study survey form (done individually by graduates invited to Saturday sessions at specific colleges, with some subsequently completed individually by telephone);
 - Roundtables will be held with representatives from the colleges, from employers and from college graduates;
 - A draft report will be produced that pulls together the information obtained through all of the foregoing steps; and,
 - The final report will be submitted and approved by SETVET.
- The most important thing to note at this juncture is that not all information has yet been collected. Conclusions should not be drawn from the contents of this report.

COMMUNITY COLLEGE INTERVIEW FORM

Part 1: Identification

Name of College:	
Location:	
Person(s) Interviewed:	
Date of Interview:	

Part 2: Program Description

2.1 What Programs and Program Specializations are offered by the College, and in what years were the programs/specializations first introduced?

Program	Date Started	Specialization	Date Started

Part 3: Enrolments and Graduations

3.1 How many students enrolled in each Program Area and Specialization over the past 3 years (2001-02, 2002-03, 2003-04)?

3.2 How many students graduated from each Program Area and Specialization over the past 3 years (2001-02, 2002-03, 2003-04)?

Program	Specialization	Enrolments			Graduations		
		01-02	02-03	03-04	01-02	02-03	03-04

3.3 What are the trends in enrolments and graduations for the College?

3.4 What factors determine how many students the College enrolls in each Program and/or Specialization each academic year?

Part 4: Program Planning

4.1 What are the relative priorities of the College in terms of preparing students for university studies, and preparing students for labour market entry? Please explain.

	University Preparation	Labour Market Preparation
Very Low	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Low	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Average	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
High	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Very High	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Do Not Know	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.2 Does the College have any formal or informal linkages with employers or employer associations/organizations? Please describe those linkages where they exist.

	Formal Linkages	Informal Linkages
None	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
A Few	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adequate Number	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
A Good Number	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
More Than Enough	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Do Not Know	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.3 Does the College have any formal or informal linkages with other Colleges/ educational institutions? Please describe those linkages where they exist.

	Formal Linkages	Informal Linkages
None	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
A Few	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adequate Number	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
A Good Number	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
More Than Enough	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Do Not Know	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.4 Does the College try to adjust or adapt its programs/curricula to meet the labour market requirements of employers? If so, how does the College go about determining those requirements? Please explain.

Never	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sometimes	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Often	<input type="checkbox"/>
All the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.5 Does the College try to adjust or adapt its programs/curricula to meet the labour market aspirations and interests of its students? If so, how does the College go about determining those aspirations and interests? Please explain.

Never	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sometimes	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Often	<input type="checkbox"/>
All the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.6 Are the strategies, policies, and/or the recommendations of the TVET Council applied by the College in program planning, and if so, how are they applied? Please explain.

Never	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sometimes	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Often	<input type="checkbox"/>
All the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>

Part 5: Program Delivery

5.1 Has the College purchased or otherwise obtained within the past three years any new equipment or software that is used in the workplace for the performance of occupational tasks related to any of the Colleges' programs/specializations? Please explain the reason(s) for the decision to purchase/obtain the equipment/software.

5.2 Does the College gather information on the labour market (demand and supply for human resources, sectors of economic growth, etc.) that is related to the program(s) and specialization(s) it offers? Does the College make such information available to students? Please explain.

Never	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sometimes	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Often	<input type="checkbox"/>
All the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>

5.3 Does the College have employers recruit prospective employees on-campus? If so, please describe the process.

Never	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sometimes	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Often	<input type="checkbox"/>
All the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>

Part 6: Accountability for Results

6.1 Does the College track the passing rates for the Comprehensive Examinations? If so, how does it get the information? Please explain.

Never	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sometimes	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Often	<input type="checkbox"/>
All the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>

6.2 Does the College survey its students at some point after graduation to determine their success in finding employment? In finding employment in an area related to their Program and Specialization? Please explain.

	Found Employment	Found Employment in Program Area/ Specialization
Never	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sometimes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Often	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

6.3 Does the College survey employers to determine if their graduates are meeting employers' requirements? Please explain.

Never	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sometimes	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Often	<input type="checkbox"/>
All the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>

6.4 Does the College have to report on its costs and results to a government department or other organization? Please explain.

Never	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sometimes	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Often	<input type="checkbox"/>
All the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>

Appendix 1 to the Summary Report on College-Based Interviews

6.5 Is the funding obtained by the College tied in any way to its costs of operation and results attained? If so, what is the connection? Please explain.

Not at All	<input type="checkbox"/>
Partially	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mostly	<input type="checkbox"/>
Entirely	<input type="checkbox"/>

Part 7: Challenges

7.1 Are employers generally supportive of the College's programs and role in preparing students for labour market entry? Please explain.

Not at All	<input type="checkbox"/>
Partially	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mostly	<input type="checkbox"/>
Entirely	<input type="checkbox"/>

7.2 Are the relevant government departments generally supportive of the College's programs and role in preparing students for labour market entry? Please explain.

Not at All	<input type="checkbox"/>
Partially	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mostly	<input type="checkbox"/>
Entirely	<input type="checkbox"/>

7.3 Is the funding provided to the College adequate to maintain high quality programs? Please explain.

Not at All	<input type="checkbox"/>
Partially	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mostly	<input type="checkbox"/>
Entirely	<input type="checkbox"/>

7.4 Does the College have difficulty in obtaining enough qualified teachers and other staff to maintain high quality programs? Please explain.

Not at All	<input type="checkbox"/>
Partially	<input type="checkbox"/>
Half the Time	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mostly	<input type="checkbox"/>
Entirely	<input type="checkbox"/>

7.5 Please describe any other challenges or issues the College faces in maintaining high quality programs that meet employer and government department/other organization expectations.

